



OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER

SWABI IRRIGATION DIVISION-I SWABI

PHONE NO.0938-530484 -- e.mail swabiirrigation@gmail.com

No.
To

822

/M-12/G

Dated

Swabi the

11 / 08 //2026.

The Superintending Engineer
Swabi Irrigation Circle Swabi

Subject:-

APPROVAL OF TENDER

It is submitted that the following tender has been received, opened through EPADs on 13.07.2026 and evaluated/ scrutinized in accordance with the applicable KPPRA rules and departmental procedures. The detailed comparative statement, evaluation report, coupled with supporting documents has been duly prepared.

The tenders have been evaluated on merit, responsiveness, and in compliance with the bidding documents, which is recommended for approval and return, please.

Work No.	Name of work	E/Cost (M)	Bid Cost (M)	Name of Govt: Contractor
	ADP No.2132/251497 (2025-26) Construction of flood protection works/ Irrigation Channels, Check Dams and Canal Patrol roads in Central District of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (Swabi, Mardan, Charsadda, Peshawar and Nowshera) Approved at Agenda item No.3 in 21st DDWP meeting held on 04.06.2026 for Rs.5300 million			
1	Sub-work: - A-14 Construction of flood protection work for the protection of agricultural lands at Naki Khwar U/C Palo Dheri Tehsil Rustam District Mardan	14.63	11.704	M/S Shaheen Khan Govt: Contractor

Encl:01 No. Tender documents
In original

Executive Engineer,
Swabi Irrigation Division-I Swabi



OFFICE OF THE SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER
SWABI IRRIGATION CIRCLE SWABI
Phone & Fax # 0938920030

No.
To

10

/6-M

Dated Swabi the 10/08/2026

The Executive Engineer
Swabi Irrigation Division-1 Swabi

Subject: -

**RECOMMENDATION FOR DECLEARING THE BID AS NON
RESPONSIVE DUE TO INCONSISTANT, UNREALISTEC AND
TECHNICALLY UNWORKABLE RATE ANALASIS**

Reference:-

Your office letter No. 717/M-12/G1: dated 30.07.2026

As recommended by you vide letter under referee regarding the subject issue is
Hereby approved in the best Govt: and public interest.

Superintending Engineer
Swabi Irrigation circle Swabi.

Copy to the:-

1. Chief Engineer (North) Irrigation Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Peshawar with reference to the above, for information, please.
2. MS Abdul Wahab Government Contractor and General Order Suppliers.

Superintending Engineer
Swabi Irrigation circle Swabi.

(3)

OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE ENGINEER

SWABI IRRIGATION DIVISION-I, SWABI

Phone # 0938-530484 email.swabi1irrigation@gmail.com

No. 717 /M-12/61
To,

Dated Swabi, the 30/07/2026

The Superintending Engineer,
Swabi Irrigation Circle Swabi

Subject: RECOMMENDATION FOR DECLARING THE BID AS NON-RESPONSIVE DUE TO INCONSISTENT, UNREALISTIC AND TECHNICALLY UNWORKABLE RATE ANALYSIS

It is respectfully submitted that during the scrutiny of the financial proposal submitted by the lowest evaluated bidder, the detailed rate analysis furnished by the bidder has been examined from both technical and financial perspectives. The scrutiny has revealed significant inconsistencies and unrealistic assumptions which fail to substantiate the quoted bid and do not demonstrate the financial viability of the offered rates.

It has been observed that the calculations incorporated in the submitted rate analysis correspond to **approximately 30% below the Schedule of Rates**, whereas the bidder has actually quoted **27.10% below the Schedule of Rates**. This discrepancy itself establishes that the submitted rate analysis has not been prepared on the basis of the accepted quoted bid. A rate analysis prepared on a different percentage than the quoted bid cannot represent the contractor's actual contractual commitment and, therefore, fails to justify the offered rates.

Furthermore, the cost assumptions adopted in the submitted rate analysis are found to be unrealistic and inconsistent with the prevailing market conditions. The contractor has adopted a labour wage of **Rs.700 per labour per day**, whereas the prevailing market rate is approximately **Rs.1,530 per labour per day** as per notification No.SOL/LD/8-4/2025/MWB dated 10/09/2025, resulting in an understatement of nearly **53%** of the actual labour cost. Such an unrealistically low labour component significantly reduces the analysed cost of execution and renders the rate analysis technically unreliable. Similarly, the contractor has adopted material rates considerably lower than the prevailing market rates. The adoption of below-market material rates without supporting evidence does not reflect the true procurement cost under prevailing market conditions.

The combined effect of preparing the rate analysis on an incorrect bid percentage together with the adoption of unrealistic labour wages and understated material rates has resulted in an artificially reduced cost structure. Consequently, the submitted rate analysis does not represent the actual expenditure required for execution of the work and fails to establish the financial viability

(4)

of the quoted bid. Instead of substantiating the offered rates, the analysis relies upon unrealistic assumptions that are neither technically acceptable nor commercially practicable.

A technically sound rate analysis is expected to reflect prevailing market rates of labour, materials, machinery, transportation, overheads and contractor's profit. Since the submitted analysis fails to satisfy these fundamental requirements, it cannot be relied upon for evaluating the reasonableness or sustainability of the quoted rates.

In view of the above observations, the submitted rate analysis is considered **inconsistent, unrealistic, financially unreliable and technically unworkable**. Therefore, it is recommended that the bid of the subject bidder may be declared **non-responsive** under **Rule 29(1) of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Public Procurement Rules** read with **KPPRA Notification No. S.R.O. (14)/Vol-I-24/2021-22 dated 10-05-2022, Para-2, Clause-(iv)**, which provides that:

"In case the detailed rate analysis submitted with the bid is, in the view of the Procuring Entity, not convincing, the Head of the Procuring Entity may declare such bid as non-responsive without any forfeiture of bid security, provided that reasons are recorded."

The case is, therefore, submitted for kind consideration and further necessary action.

Executive Engineer
Swabi Irrigation Division-I Swabi

Copy to:

✓ The Chief Engineer (North), Irrigation Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar, for information, please.


Executive Engineer

BID EVALUATION REPORT

Name of work: - ADP No.2132/251497 (2025-26) Construction of Flood protection works/ Irrigation Channels, Check Dams and Canal Patrol roads in Central District of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (Swabi, Mardan, Charsadda, Peshawar and Nowshera) Approved at Agenda item No.3 in 21st DDWP meeting held on 04.06.2026 for Rs.5300 million

Sub-work: - A-14 Construction of flood protection work for the protection of agricultural lands at Naki Khwar U/C Palo Dheri Tehsil Rustam District Mardan

Estimated cost Rs. 14.63 Million

Earnest Money Rs.0.2926 million

1. The work was put to tender vide Executive Engineer, Swabi Irrigation Division-1 Swabi office letter No. 561/M-12/GI., dated 18/06/2026 and also uploaded on EPADS, KPPRA and Irrigation website. The NIT was published in Aaj newspaper Peshawar dated 23-06-2026 with No. INF(P) 3125/26..
2. The pre bid meeting was scheduled on 06/05/2026 in the Office of the Executive Engineer, Swabi Irrigation Division-1 Swabi and the same was held on due date and time in the presence of committee members. Minutes of the meeting and attendance list are attached.
3. Nine (09) Nos. bids were received through EPADS in the office of the Executive Engineer, Swabi Irrigation Division-1 Swabi on stipulated date & time i.e 13.07.2026 at 10.30 AM while Nine (9) Nos firm submitted their Sealed envelopes on the said address through courier. Electronic bid opening was carried out through EPADS on the same day i.e.13-07-2026 at 10.30 A.M in presence of the procurement Committee notified vide Chief Engineer (North) Notification No. 1240/C-1/KPPRA,dated Peshawar 04-05-2026 and contractors who desired to participate in the bid opening.
4. The attendance sheets of procuring committee and contractors/representatives participated in bid opening along with other documents are attached.
5. The bids offered by the contractors through EPADS in respect of the above-mentioned sub work having estimated cost of Rs. 14.63 million is accordingly evaluated by the procurement committee. The detail of evaluation is furnished as under.

S #	Category	Enlistment No	Name of Contractor / Firm	Tender cost/ E/Cost (M)	Contractor premium above/below		CDR Amount (M)			CDR No, date with issuing bank	Bid cost (Million)	Mandatory requirements					Remarks
					S.I Rate %	NSI Rate %	E/M 2%	Addl Secy:	Total (M)			Rate analysis Yes/No.	KPPR A Yes/No	NTN Yes/No	Enlistment Yes/No	PEC Specialized Codes reqd in NIT YES/No	
1	C2	3811	Shaheen Khan Govt. Contractor	14.63	-20	-20	0.2926	1.1704	1.463	2033398 & 2033403 Dated:8-7-26 BOK RS.292600 RS.1170400 T-RS.1463000/-	11.704	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
2	C2	5135	Abdul Wahab	14.63	-27.10	-27.10	0.2926	3.96473	4.25733	445880 & 81 Dated:10-7-26 JS BANK RS.4588000 RS.293000 T-RS.4881000/-	10.66527	Attached	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Non-responsive due to submission of rate analysis is mathematically incorrect and not in accordance with the BOQ. The verified bid is more than 30% below the Engineers Estimate instead of the claimed 27.10%.

3	C4	21192	Sherdad Khel Group	14.63	-10	-10	0.2926	0	0.2926	519046 Dated:10-7-26 Bank Islami RS.292600/-	13.167	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
4	C4	16842	Niaz Parwar & Sons	14.63	-10	-10	0.2926	0	0.2926	2064080 Dated:11-7-26 BOK RS.293000/-	13.167	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
5	C2	3760	Salarzai Constr. Co	14.63	-10	-10	0.2926	0	0.2926	Not provided	13.167	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Non-Responsive
6	C3	11235	Mehrab Khan & Brother	14.63	-20	-20	0.2926	1.1704	1.463	2037150 & 57 Dated:9-7-26 BOK RS.292600 RS.1170400 T-RS.1463000/-	11.704	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
7	—	—	M/S Murad Ali & Sons	14.63	-10	-10	0.2926	0	0.2926	2064075 Dated:11-7-26 BOK RS.293000/-	13.167	N/A	No	No	No	No	No	Non-Responsive
8	C2	2534	Zaigham & Brother Constr.	14.63	-10	-10	0.2926	0	0.2926	372906 Dated:12-7-26 Ubl Ameen RS.292600/-	13.167	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive
9	C3	9974	Jamal Khel Constr. Company	14.63	-10	-10	0.2926	0	0.2926	445882 Dated:10-7-26 JS BANK T-RS.293000/-	13.167	N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Responsive

6. A total of Nine (09) bids were received. Upon detailed evaluation, 06 bids were found responsive and 03 bids as found non-responsive due to non compliance with the bidding requirements.

7. As per NIT Condition No. 7 & 8, which states that "in case of same rates quoted by the bidders, the lowest/successful bidder shall be decided through draw," the Procurement Committee conducted a draw in a transparent manner.

8. Based on the draw notified vide this office order/ notification No. No.658/M-12/General dated 17.07.2026 and accordingly draw conducted in the office of the Superintending Engineer Swabi Irrigation circle Swabi on 29.07.2026 in the presence of the Procurement Committee & the Contractors/ their representatives. M/S Shaheen Khan Govt. Contractor, was declared as the successful bidder.

9. In view of para 7 & 8 above, the rate of successful bidder @ Rs. 11.704 million @ 20.00% below premium on Schedule and Non-Schedule items, offered by M/S Shaheen Khan Govt: Contractor. Contractor, is hereby recommended by the Procurement Committee for approval of the Competent Authority in light of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Delegation of Financial Powers Rules, Third Schedule (Special Powers), Section-11, S. No. 02, please.

Procurement Committee

Sub Divisional Officer
Irrigation Sub Divn: Shahbaz
Garhi (Member)

Head Clerk
Swabi Irrigation Divin-1
Swabi (Member)

Superintendent O/O the
Swabi Irrigation Circle Swabi
(Member)

Executive Engineer
Swabi Irrigation Divin-1
Swabi (Chairman
/Procurement Officer

Recommended by

Approved by

As recommended by the Chairman Procurement Committee, the lowest Rate quoted by M/S Shaheen Khan Govt: Contractor. Contractor Rs. 11.704 million being the 1st lowest was declared through draw as successful responsive bidder is hereby approved

Superintending Engineer
Swabi Irrigation Circle Swabi.
(Procuring Entity)